Recommendation: Violence & Incitement Carve-outs
Our Violence and Incitement policy prohibits threats and content inciting violence that could lead to real-world harm, but existing carve-outs in our Violence and Incitement policy permit such threats against people accused or convicted of crimes, in order to avoid enforcing on speech involving current events.

We recognize that certain forms of this speech allow people to discuss, express anger against, and seek justice for crimes; however, we also want to recognize the inherent human dignity of the accused in this speech.
Sensitive Content
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs

Examples

Allow

![Image 1](image1.png)
No mercy to rapists...
#PunishRapistsPublic
#RIPRipVankaReddy

 ![Image 2](image2.png)
Brexit News
0y 0m 30d 6h 27m

Sign and share 64000 signatures already. Stop Shamima Begum returning to the UK for public safety.

External Link
Sign the Petition

Stop Shamima Begum returning to the UK for public safety

Tom
Hang her by the neck until dead
0y 0m 30d 3h 17m

Allow
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs

Examples

**Allow**

- A notification for a man wanted for attempted murder on Los Angeles County Sheriff's deputies.

**Remove**

- A post with an image of an American flag being burned.

- A comment: "He deserves a bullet to the head."
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs

**Examples**

**Allow**

- Utterly despicable.
  - Daily Mirror
  - May 28
  - Mum 'poisoned son, wrapped his body in a sheet and dumped it at their old home'

**Allow**

- Hamilton County Prosecutor Joe Deters released a statement on the Ohio Supreme Court’s decision to uphold the conviction of serial killer Anthony Kirkland. Authorities say Kirkland killed two teenage girls and two women between 2006-2009. The victims are Esme Kenney, 13, Cassonya Crawford, 14, Kimya Rollison, 25, and Mary Jo Newton, 45. FOX19
  - August 10 at 6:43 PM
  - Reply: y'all need to sentence him to death 😞😞😞😞😞😞.....
Recommendation

Narrow the current carve-out to allow for certain threats of violence towards Dangerous Individuals and Organizations and perpetrators of an act of high-severity violence or sexual offense

Source
Multiple escalations

External Outreach
49 External Engagements

Working Groups
10 XFN Working Groups
We permit (1) calls for action, (2) statements advocating for, and (3) aspirational or conditional statements to commit high and mid-severity violence against an organization or individual covered in the Dangerous Individuals and Organizations policy, or is described as having carried out violent crimes or sexual offenses, wherein criminal/predator status has been established by media reports, market knowledge of news event, etc.

### Violence and Incitement Carve-outs

#### Status Quo

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>High-Severity - lethal</th>
<th>Mid-Severity - serious injury</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Statements of Intent</td>
<td>“I am going to kill Joe”</td>
<td>“I’m going to beat Rachel”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calls for Action</td>
<td>“Let’s kill them”</td>
<td>“Punch those rapists”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements Advocating for</td>
<td>“He should be stabbed”</td>
<td>“Jane deserves to be kicked”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aspirational Statements</td>
<td>“I hope they hang him”</td>
<td>“I wish they hit Bob”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditional Statements</td>
<td>“If convicted, she should be</td>
<td>“If they find him, then they</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 1                             |                                        | 2                                      |
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs

Research Findings

- U.S. jurisprudence tends to prioritize free speech in this domain unless it promotes and is likely to lead to "imminent lawless action". Those accused of crimes are afforded equal protections.
  - In some contexts, accusations are disproportionately levied against minority groups.

- There may be a relationship between incitement on social media and offline violence, but research has not identified evidence of a causal linkage—practical and ethical constraints limit rigorous research on this topic. Research has in some instances identified causal linkages between media content more broadly and public behavior (e.g., protest movements), but research is not specific to this carve-out.

- Research does find that many people believe that online incitement causes real offline violence. Research also finds, however, that public concerns about censorship and biased suppression of free speech by social media platforms are on the rise, although such research is once again not specific to this carve-out.

We connected with 47 stakeholders and conducted two multi-stakeholder roundtables on this issue, including with experts in international humanitarian law, criminal justice, vigilantism as well as many civil society organisations.
Key Themes:

- Many stakeholders expressed concern about the carve-out possibly leading to offline or vigilante violence.
- Freedom of speech experts said a blanket ban on all violent speech goes too far.
- Criminal justice experts said inequities in judicial systems mean marginalised groups are disproportionately targeted with violent speech.
- Safety groups said not allowing victims and marginalised groups to express anger at horrible acts silences them further.
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs
Maintain Status Quo plus Refinements

Maintain status quo, and issue clarifying guidance to address known enforcement ambiguity such as defining who is considered a violent criminal, what is considered a violent act, and what is considered a credible media outlet, etc.

Pros
- Allows for expression of diverse views
- Allows victims to feel empowered

Cons
- May contribute to a culture of violence which could encourage vigilantism and mob justice
- Disproportionately impacts marginalized groups who are more likely to be accused of violent attacks
- Difficult to automate
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs
Examples - Option 1

Allow
Allow
Allow
Remove
Allow
Allow

Violence and incitement carve-outs examples - Option 1.
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs
Allow Certain Threats Towards Perpetrators of an Act of High-Severity Violence or Sexual Offense

Narrow the carve-out to allow advocating, conditional, and aspirational statements of violence when targeted towards those described as having carried out an act of high-severity violence or sexual offense

Pros
- Removes calls for violence that could lead to real world incitement to violence
- Allows for victims to share what's important to them in the aftermath of high-severity violence or sexual offenses
- Allows for political speech pertaining to designated individuals and groups under DOI policy

Cons
- Limits some speech even in the context of advocating for justice or raising awareness
- Difficult to explain to someone that they didn't express their emotion in the right way
- May contribute to inconsistent enforcement

Option 2 (Rec)
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs

Examples - Option 2 (Rec)
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs
Allow threats of violence towards Dangerous Individuals and Organizations and groups of criminals

Narrow carve-out to allow threats of high and mid-severity violence against organizations and individuals covered in the Dangerous Individuals and Organizations policy, and groups of violent criminals

Pros
- Prevents potential real-world harm towards accused individuals
- Easier to operationalize and automate enforcement

Cons
- Does not address how people speak when advocating for justice for a victim or current event
- Difficult to explain to someone that they didn’t express their emotion in the right way
- Removes speech about violent criminals, which may include calls for justice
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs

Examples - Option 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Remove</th>
<th>Allow</th>
<th>Remove</th>
<th>Remove</th>
<th>Remove</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image2.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image3.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image4.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image5.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs
Remove Carve-Out

Remove all threats of high and mid-severity violence against individuals described as having carried out acts or high-severity violence or a sexual offense

Pros
- Consistent with our policy rationale to remove all threats that could contribute to potential real-world harm and vigilantism
- Improves ability to automate removal of violent threats

Cons
- Limits users ability to raise awareness and call for justice around current events in their community and political discourse
- Difficult to explain to someone that they didn’t express their emotion in the right way
- Inequitable treatment of designated groups and individuals versus violent criminals and sexual offenders
Violence and Incitement Carve-outs
Examples - Option 4

- Remove
- Allow
- Remove
- Remove
- Remove
- Remove
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Examples</th>
<th>Option 1</th>
<th>Option 2 (Rec)</th>
<th>Option 3</th>
<th>Option 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Hang a rapist”</td>
<td>Allow</td>
<td>Allow*</td>
<td>Allow*</td>
<td>Remove</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Post: Petition to allow a terrorist bride to return to the UK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: “Hang her by the neck until dead”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Post: BOLO for an armed suspect accused of killing two officers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: “He deserves a bullet to the head”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Post: Video of BLM protestors burning an American flag</td>
<td>Remove</td>
<td>Remove</td>
<td>Remove</td>
<td>Remove</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: “Shoot every one of those terrorists”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Post: News report of a mother poisoning her son</td>
<td>Allow</td>
<td>Remove</td>
<td>Remove</td>
<td>Remove</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: “Let’s inject her with botox until she dies”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Post: News report communicating the conviction of a serial</td>
<td>Allow</td>
<td>Allow</td>
<td>Remove</td>
<td>Remove</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>killer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: “Y’all need to sentence him to death”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Violence & Incitement Carve-Outs
External Outreach - 4 Options

Option 1: Status Quo

Option 2: Recommendation

Option 3: Targeting Groups

Option 4: Remove Carve-Out
Next Steps

**Developments**
- Work with Global Ops and CI to operationalize policy recommendation

**Comms**
- Work with Comms to update external facing Community Standards language

**Launch**
- Proposed launch date: January 2021